



BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL & DENTAL
COUNCIL

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF. 8-2175/2022-DC/PMC

Mr. Ashiq Ali Awan against Dr. Mumtaz Begum (43736-S)

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zubair Khan	Chairman
Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor	Secretary
Prof. Dr. Mahmud Aurangzeb	Member
Mr. Jawad Amin Khan	Member

Present:

Mr. Ashique Ali Awan	Complainant
Dr. Mumtaz Begum (43736-S) (online)	Respondent
Hearing dated	05.07.2024

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

1. Mr. Ashique Ali Awan (the "Complainant") filed a Complaint before the Disciplinary Committee on 11.10.2022 against Dr. Mumtaz Ramzan Awan (the "Respondent") working at A. Sattar Bakhtawar Medical Centre, Halani, Naushehro Feroze (the "Hospital"). Brief facts of the Complaint are:

The patient visited her gynecologist (who earlier performed two successful C-sections of patient) who diagnosed non-growing fetus at 12-weeks stage of pregnancy of patient. Dilation and Curettage (DNC) was performed by the Respondent; 1 pack of blood was transfused and patient was discharged.



The patient's condition deteriorated and she remained in touch with Respondent who advised painkillers, normal saline and acidity regulators. Still, patient's condition worsened and she was taken to Gambat Institute of Medical Sciences, Khairpur. Patient's condition was stabilized and she was shifted to Hira Medical Centre, Sukkur in ICU. The patient's condition had plummeted with shortness of breath with Altered level of consciousness, where doctors advised exploratory laparotomy, which was performed after high-risk consent. The doctors' findings were "2x2 cm perforation at fundus of uterus, 2 perforations at terminal ileum 1 ft proximal to ICJ, 2 liters of feculent fluid in peritoneal cavity

Complainant alleged that the patient never regained consciousness and later succumbing to the fatal complications caused by ill-performed DNC and negligent behavior/ treatment of the Respondent towards the patient....

II. SHOW CAUSE NOTICE ISSUED TO RESPONDENT

2. In view of the allegations leveled in the Complaint, a Show Cause Notice dated 15.11.2022 was issued to the Respondent doctor, in the following terms:

"... 3. **WHEREAS**, a Complaint has been filed by Mr. Ashique Ali Awan (the "Complainant") before the Disciplinary Committee of the Commission (the "Complaint") which is enclosed along with its annexures and shall be read as an integral part of this notice; and

4. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the complaint, it has been alleged that you negligently performed Dilation & Curettage (D&C) procedure on Mst. Abida Awan (the "Patient") during her 12th week of pregnancy with a diagnosis of non-growing fetus. Consequent thereto, the patient suffered severe pain, and was diagnosed with "Ascending peritonitis and Multi organ dysfunction syndrome (MODS). The patient underwent Exploratory Laparotomy owed to suspected perforation as a result of ill-performed D&C. The patient never regained consciousness thereafter and expired; and

5. **WHEREAS**, you are registered with Pakistan Medical Commission under Registration No. 43736-S, possessing the degree of Basic Medical Qualification (MBBS) only. A general practitioner cannot practice in the field of specialty without requisite qualification duly recognized by this Commission and represent, as having acquired or seek to practice a specialty, unless the same is recognized by this Commission. Therefore, per facts mentioned in this Notice, your conduct of practicing and representing



as Gynecology is in violation of Section 29 (2), (8) & (10) of the Act, read with Regulation 8(2) of Code of Ethics of Practice for medical and dental practitioners, Regulations, 2011; and ...”

III. REPLY OF RESPONDENT

3. The Respondent submitted his response on 07.12.2022, wherein she stated, in terms, as under:

“... totally deny and condemn the false baseless allegations made by Mr. Ashiq Ali Awan, his allegation tends that he might be miss-led by someone despite of passing so many days. I am a Medical Practitioner registered with P.M.C (attached License) which is dually renewed as according to rules and also my hospital is registered with S.H.C.C. Hospital is following all rules and regulation described by P.M.C and S.H.C.C. We also follow Code of Ethics of Practice for Medical & Dental Practitioners, Regulations 2011. I had signed MOU's with Gynecologists Anesthetists and we have well trained degree holder staff as well. I also have got training and attended all workshops requirement for DCPS/MCPS from Sobhraj Maternity Hospital Karachi for 2 years, and appeared in exams of CPSP but unlikely did not cleared but am again willing to appear in next scheduled exams. also had got training of ultrasound. Patient History and Background Facts are that Mrs, Abida Wife of Altaf Awan, 2 days prior to dilation & Evacuation (D & E) came with gestational amenorrhea 12 weeks Ultrasound was showing about 5 week sac without fetal pole and admitted to hospital for induction of miscarriage but during her admission time She did not aborted that's why she was sent back to home with Tab: Mesoprostol 200g and advised her to remain in contact with hospital. On 15 September 2022 as she started to bleed, she reached to hospital again. I examined her, she was stable vitally and on PV her OS was dilated so evacuation was planned under sedation and RPOC's were taken with sponge holding forcep. "As I had used sponge holding forcep and did not curette how could I damage her gut? Maybe she had underlined pelvic infection that might had worsen after evacuation

After that she complained pain for that pain killer injection was given to her. On the evening she left the hospital along with her husband Altaf Awan on her foos with a very stable condition

On the same night she sent message on Whatsapp mid-night 12:22 AM. at that time was sleeping, after that she made a call on about 4 to 5 AM which was being responded she told me that she is having epigastric pain, it is also to be noted that her stomach and epigastric problem was laying prior to dilation & Evacuation (D&E), so therefore offered her to come to my hospital or any other hospital which better



suited to them for treatment but she asked me to suggest her some medications on call so suggested her to take Syp: Muccain and Risek and some pain killers.

On the other day of dilation & evacuation (D&E) about 2:22 PM evening patient & her husband asked me that should they go to Gambat hospital GIMS so that said them to go to GIMS Gambat hospital in emergency department to get well treated. What so ever is done in GIMS Gambat and further in Hira Hospital we are unaware.

The main thing is allegation of negligence which they are imposing on me that is totally wrong because if patient had any severe pain or condition was getting worse her husband must had to take responsibility of negligence, who had not taken her to my or any hospital despite they were having their own ride. Noted that from midnight to next day's evening her husband kept her at home even if her condition was not good and getting worsen and worsen as according to them.

Mrs. Abida w/o Altaf Awan was shining star and talented student of PhD, may Allah grant the deceased a high place in Heaven (Jannat). I am also deeply saddened by the death of Mrs. Abida w/o Altaf Awan and feel sorrows to her family.

Note: The same complain already made to Sindh Health Care Commission by Mr. Ashiq Ali Awan for which we are also being replying on to their notice as accordingly. ...”

IV. REJOINDER OF COMPLAINANT

4. A letter dated 08.12.2022 was written to the Complainant enclosing the comments received from the Respondent, directing him to submit his rejoinder.
5. Rejoinder was received from the Complainant on 15.012.2022, wherein he highlighted that the Respondent admits to not being a qualified Gynecologist (MCPS/FCPS) and tat she operated the patient. Further, that the patient was in touch with Respondent, however, she allowed patient to proceed to GIMS Hospital, 60 kilometers away, despite condition of patient.

V. HEARING

6. The matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee for 05.07.2024. Notices dated



27.06.2024 were issued to the Complainant, Mr. Ashiq Ali Awan and Respondent, Dr. Mumtaz Begum directing them to appear before the Disciplinary Committee on 05.07.2024.

7. On the date of hearing, the Complainant was present in person and the Respondent doctor was present through online mode before the Disciplinary Committee.
8. The Complainant was asked to present his complaint where he narrated the facts of his complaint, in terms, that patient visited Respondent who diagnosed non-growing fetus at 12-weeks stage of pregnancy of patient. Dilation and Curettage (DNC) was advised and performed by Respondent; with blood transfusion and patient was discharged. Later, the patient's condition deteriorated and she remained in touch with Respondent who advised painkillers still, patient's condition worsened and she was taken to Gambat Institute of Medical Sciences, Khairpur. Patient's condition was stabilized and she was shifted to Hira Medical Centre, Sukkur in ICU. The patient's condition had plummeted with shortness of breath, where doctors advised exploratory laparotomy, which was performed after high-risk consent. Complainant alleged that the patient never regained consciousness and later succumbing to the fatal complications caused by ill-performed DNC and negligent behavior/treatment of the Respondent towards the patient.
9. The Respondent was asked to present his version, where she narrated the contents of her submitted response to the Disciplinary Committee. She also stated that the patient was her friend who was in contact with her and she guided her professionally and on humanitarian grounds as well. However, the complainant and his relatives are threatening her with dire consequences, but do not own the fact that the patient was kept at home for two days while she was experiencing bleeding and they took no steps to get her treatment from even any other doctor / gynecologist.

VI. EXPERT OPINION

10. An Expert of Gynecology was appointed to assist the Disciplinary Committee in this matter. The Expert opined as under:

“Needs CME+ training and advice to appear in examination before starting practice again ... case who ultimately died because of delay in surgical intervention. Needs suspension from PM&DC ...”



VII. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

11. The Disciplinary Committee has perused the relevant record, heard the submissions of the parties at length and considered the expert opinion in the instant Complaint.
12. The Disciplinary Committee notes that the Respondent doctor stated that she performed ultrasound of the patient, due to non-growing fetus, but on enquiry the doctor stated that she is not a qualified sonologist. It is an admitted fact that the patient had history of previous 02 C-sections and as per the doctor she performed only the evacuation of the patient, which in the opinion of this Committee when performed in a conventional way was a dangerous procedure. To mitigate the risks of such patients, the manual vacuum aspirator (MVA) kits may have been used, which was not the case.
13. It is further gleaned from the statement of the respondent doctor that she personally knew the patient and her medical situation as the patient was in contact with her. In our considered opinion, the respondent doctor should not have treated the patient and instead referred her to a tertiary care Hospital, at the earliest, e.g. Gambat Institute of Medical Sciences, Khairpur, which was within reasonable distance and approachable.
14. In view of the complaint, statements of the parties and the evidences available, the Disciplinary Committee finds the Respondent, Dr. Mumtaz Begum (43736-S) guilty of medical negligence in the instant complaint. Accordingly, it is recommended that the medical license of Dr. Mumtaz Begum (43736-S) be suspended for a period of one (01) year. A copy of this decision will be sent for explanation to the Gambat Institute of Medical Sciences, Khairpur, regarding absence of Gynecologist at its emergency, due to which was referred to another Hospital, ultimately causing the death of the patient.
15. This instant Complaint is disposed of in the above terms.





Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zubair Khan
Chairman

11 September, 2024